



# Early Childhood Policy Council

## Meeting Agenda, Attendance, and Summary Report

Tuesday, September 19, 2023

9:00 a.m. – 12:00 p.m.

**Physical Meeting:** 1000 G St, Sacramento, CA 95814, WestEd, Floor 5, Capitol Room

### Agenda

1. Welcome and Introduction
  - Welcome
  - Report out from Chairs of Advisory Committees
  - Voices from the field
  - Public comment
2. Child Care Transition Quarterly Report
  - Update from the California Department of Social Services on the transition of child care programs
  - Council questions
  - Public comment
3. Rate and Quality Advisory Panel Update
  - Status update
  - Council questions
  - Public comment
4. Supporting Young Multilingual Learners and Their Families
  - Panel discussion
  - Council discussion
  - Public comment
5. Adjourn

### Attendance:

**ECPC Council Members:** Antoinette Jacobs, Carola Oliva-Olson, Cheryl Polk, Dean Tagawa, Donna Sneeringer, Kim Johnson, Kim Patillo Brownson, Lupe Jaime-Mileham, Mayra E. Alvarez, Mary Ignatius, Miren Algorri, Natali Gaxiola, Robin Layton, Sarah Neville-Morgan, Scott Moore, Sonia Jaramillo, Tonia McMillian

**Parent Advisory Committee Members:** Deborah Corley-Marzett, Naima Facih, Mary Ignatius, Patricia Lozano, Yenni Rivera

**Workforce Advisory Committee Members:** Miren Algorri, AnnLouise Bonnitto, Tonia McMillian, Zoila Toma, Debra Ward

**Guests:** Ana Herrera,Carolyn Crolotte, Idania Hernandez, JunHee Doh, Leslie McFarlane, Nicole Baitx-Kennedy, Stephen Propheter

## Summary Report:

### Welcome and Introduction: Kim Johnson, Chair

Full welcoming remarks are recorded in pages 3 – 5 of the [ECPC September 19 meeting transcript](#).

**Kim Johnson**, Director of the California Department of Social Services (CDSS), opened the third Early Childhood Policy Council (ECPC) meeting of 2023. She welcomed attendees and expressed gratitude for the opportunity for thought partnership. Director Johnson expressed the hope that all participants see new investments as a direct reflection of their advocacy and hard work to lift up the needs of communities, children, and families across California.

After reviewing the agenda, Director Johnson welcomed the chairs of the Parent and Workforce Advisory Committees.

### Report Out from Chairs of Advisory Committees:

**Tonia McMillian**, Chair of the Workforce Advisory Committee, thanked everyone who joined the August 29 Joint Advisory Committee convening. She shared that the meetings' guest speaker, Laura Pryor from the California Budget & Policy Center, presented on big wins in the 2023–24 state budget that were fought for by ECPC. Committee members also brainstormed policy issues to lift up on behalf of parents and providers moving forward. Ms. McMillian emphasized that this work is not done.

**Mary Ignatius**, Chair of the Parent Advisory Committee, provided more details on the areas of need identified by committee members:

- Improved outreach for community-based programs and services, including infant and toddler care.
- Creation of career pathways and appropriate compensation, especially for upward movement.
- Free education programs and loan forgiveness.
- Clear directives from CDSS for increased collaboration in the early education system, especially to be more inclusive of family child care (FCC) providers.
- Including early education in school bond funding.
- Expanding paid family leave, including increased access and wage replacement.

- Increased availability of infant and toddler care and increased pay for providers.
- Improved special needs evaluations and better training for providers serving children with special needs.
- FCC licensing reforms to tie a license to the provider rather than only to the service address.

At the November 16 Joint Advisory Committee meeting, committee members will return to these topics to develop policy recommendations to be shared with ECPC.

**Director Johnson** thanked Ms. McMillian and Ms. Ignatius. She noted that the proposed list of recommendations are within the ECPC’s purview and overlap with the priorities of the Master Plan on Early Learning and Care (MPELC) and other guiding documents. ECPC will continue to refer to those frames in its implementation efforts.

Director Johnson shared that CDSS recently hosted an overview of child care and development funding in the 2023–24 state budget. A Child Care Bulletin with budget details was released September 18. Director Johnson recognized the state’s “tremendous investments in children and youth behavioral health... and how we are thinking about those intersections and connections.” The budget provides CalWORKs Grant increases, expanded access to food supports and many other programs and services to increase economic security for families experiencing poverty. The total investment in young children and their families is now over \$1 billion. Director Johnson expressed gratitude to the Governor and Legislature for this as well as the second historic agreement with Child Care Providers United (CCPU).

Director Johnson promised to share links to the budget explanation documents mentioned and expressed enthusiasm to begin the work enabled by the new funding.

For more information, access the following resources:

- [Childcare Bulletin No. 23-25, with details of 2023–24 budget investments](#)
- [CDSS 2023 Budget Act Executive Summary.](#)
- [ECPC September 19, 2023 meeting transcript \(ECPC transcript\), pages 5 – 11.](#)

### Voices From the Field

Director Johnson invited Council member Maya Alvarez to introduce the first of two speakers to share as voices from the field.

**Mayra Alvarez** welcomed Leslie McFarlane, practice director at the San Diego Community Birth Center. She recognized Ms. McFarlane as a critical leader who supported listening sessions to better understand the experiences of San Diego families, particularly Black and Brown families.

**Leslie McFarlane** thanked Ms. Alvarez for the introduction and provided additional details on her background in birth equity work. She is practice director at San Diego Community Birth Center, a student midwife, birth assistant, perinatal navigator with Healthy Start, childbirth educator, and lactation education counselor, as well as a parent.

She shared her experiences as a mother to three children—Nari, age eight, Teddy, age four, and Teo, age two—on their journey to access culturally congruent care and support. Ms. McFarlane advocated for purposefully helping parents and communities address the obstacles that Black and Brown families encounter.

**Director Johnson** thanked Ms. McFarlane for sharing her experience and raising awareness among those “responsible for those systems and connections and thought partners in that space.” She then invited **AnnLouise Bonnitto**, Tribal Child Development Department Director at California Rural Indian Health Board (CRIHB) to speak as a voice from the field.

**AnnLouise Bonnitto** recapped a CRIHB meeting on how recent reforms and policy changes to fee waivers have impacted tribal communities. She shared that fee waivers provided significant benefits in addressing hardships surrounding child care in tribal areas, such as limited resources in remote areas, family and employment challenges, and impacts of COVID. “Under the federal child care program that we administer, we were also able to create what’s called categorical eligibility like in Head Start where if you are a member and you can prove that you are a member of one of the California Tribes that we service and you live within the service area that we define within our grant, you automatically qualify, and you do not have to provide that income guideline information that we used to have in the past.”

She discussed the progress of tribal child care programs: “We are still in our infancy when it comes to tribal child care and early education programs...in the last 20 years, we finally started getting our foot in the door and partnering up with our state partners, our local partners, and obviously our federal partners to have us at the table...creating that continuity that a family can go from one system to the other has been very valuable to our families, but (also) to us as administrators.” She noted that help is still needed to ensure tribal children referred for special needs and disabilities assessment and services get access quickly. Ms. Bonnitto thanked the panel representatives for working with tribal communities.

**Director Johnson** thanked Ms. Bonnitto for her comments, which echo the intersections of the ECPC and the California State Advisory Council on early intervention, and for elevating the voice of Tribes and tribal leaders in the child care space. She noted that she would be engaging in a formal government-to-government consultation with tribal leaders on September 20. She also recognized the [56th annual celebration of California Native American Day](#), to be held at the state capitol from 10:00 a.m. to 2:30 p.m on September 22. Director Johnson will be participating in the program lifting up the success of the Indian Child Welfare Act across California.

**Ms. Bonnitto** added that the California Native American Day event offers information about what the Tribes do and that the agencies that oversee the child care program, California Indian Manpower Consortium and Inter-Tribal Council of California, should be there.

#### Selections From Public Comment and Chat

“Thank you for raising up importance for school districts to provide services and IEP support for students with special needs in ALL programs. Only providing services to TK

(transitional kindergarten) eligible students if they are enrolled in a district TK program prohibits families from having true choice in the education and care of their child. Moreover, at this point in TK, where classrooms are 1:12, it is necessary flexibility.”

“I appreciated the comments by AnnLouise Bonnitto with CRIHB. As the Executive Director of the Tribal Child Care Association of California, representing over 80 of the 109 Federally recognized Tribes in CA and all Tribal CCDF lead Agencies in CA, we invite partnerships to help raise the voices of Tribal Early Learning and Child Care across the entire State of CA. We are the lead agency for the TQIS in CA and Workforce Pathways. We continue to look for equitable ways to partner and align systems for the ELC communities and Child Care across the state for Tribes.”

### **Child Care Transition Quarterly Report:**

#### Update from CDSS on the Transition of Child Care Programs

At the invitation of Director Johnson, **Dr. Lupe Jaime-Mileham**, Deputy Director of CDSS’ Child Care and Development Division (CCDD), provided an update on the transition of child care and development to CDSS. Dr. Jaime-Mileham’s full remarks begin on page 9 of the [ECPC transcript](#)

CDSS held a community budget briefing on September 8. The [Child Care and Development Enacted Budget Briefing PowerPoint presentation and recording](#) are available on the CCDD webpage

Dr. Jaime-Mileham discussed the status of the Child Care Development Fund (CCDF). Administered by the Administration for Children and Families (ACF), this federal block grant provides funding for most of the state’s subsidized child care development programming and quality initiatives. California receives about \$1 billion from CCDF each year for ongoing funding. Additional details about the CCDF can be found on slide 1 of [CDSS Child Care and Development Transition Update, September 19, 2023 \(Transition Update\)](#) and page 9 of the [ECPC transcript](#).

CDSS is in early planning stages for the collaboration needed to complete the fiscal year 2025-2027 CCDF State Plan. The CCDF State Plan is a funding application submitted once every three years. States describe how they meet CCDF requirements for policies and procedures to support access and quality in subsidized child care development programs.

As required by ACF, CDSS scheduling three input sessions with ECPC, tribal partners, and statewide child care and development stakeholders to inform the plan’s development. Additionally, there will be a public hearing and a 30-day input comment period in early 2024 to allow community members to contribute. The CCDF State Plan submission deadline is no later than July 1st of 2024, and will cover the period from October 1, 2024 through September 30, 2027. CDSS needs all stakeholders to participate, and it will be providing information on how to attend input sessions.

More information on the CCDF State Plan process is available in [Transition Update, slide 3](#) and pages 9 – 10 of the [ECPC transcript](#).

Dr. Jaime-Mileham described the new, more user-friendly [Desired Results Developmental Profile \(DRDP\) online system](#), which was launched in August of this year. The DRDP is an assessment tool that all Title V contractors and center-based and FCC educational networks are required to use. The new DRDP online system:

- Provides access to an assessment instrument for teachers, providers, program administrators, and staff.
- Allows users to conduct assessments and store data online.
- Features a dashboard, profile feature, and the ability to provide parent reports in multiple languages.
- Includes added function for teachers and providers to view child's observation data while they complete their ratings.

Dr. Jaime-Mileham thanked WestEd for their continuous support on the relaunched DRDP online system, and expressed gratitude for the CDSS and CDE partnership as they both leverage the DRDP for Title V programs.

See [Transition Update, slide 4](#) and page 10 of the [ECPC transcript](#) for additional information on the DRDP.

**Dr. Jaime-Mileham** continued with additional updates, the full text of which can be read on pages 11 – 12 of the [ECPC transcript](#):

In partnership with WestEd, CDSS and the California Health and Human Services Agency have launched a comprehensive series of online professional development modules. The modules were funded by the Preschool Development Grant, co-created with a robust advisory group, and designed for early learning and care professionals of all types. Each module series is available free on the [California Early Childhood Online \(CECO\) website](#). Modules are currently available in English and Spanish with more languages coming soon. Learners will earn professional development certificates upon completion.

See [Transition Update, slide 5](#) for a partial list of available modules.

CCPU, which represents FCC providers in California, ratified a new memorandum of understanding (MOU) with the state on July 31. The agreement has now been approved by the Legislature and signed by the Governor. As a replacement for the first MOU, which expired on June 30, 2023, the new agreement includes significant developments. The articles of the agreement include:

- Provider information
- Dues deduction
- Grievance and arbitration
- Training
- Rates and incentives
- Cost of care plus rate
- Transitional provider subsidy payment
- Redefining part-time and full-time care

- Joint labor management committee
- Health and retirement trust

A summary of select topics in the MOU is available in [Transition Update, slide 6](#). The [full text of the agreement](#) is available on the [California Department of Human Resources website](#). The state has been working diligently to implement the agreed upon provisions by sharing guidance to the field through CDSS *Child Care Bulletins*.

CDSS hosted a [Child Care and Development Enacted Budget Briefing](#) on September 8 to take an in depth look at this year's budget. The Governor also signed [SB 140](#) which ratified the CCPU agreement and addressed parity in many areas for the entire field. Dr. Jaime-Mileham acknowledged “the historic investments in child care and development that is made possible by all of your work in this arena. CDSS wants to thank you.”

Among the changes to celebrate, Dr. Jaime-Mileham highlighted the new family fee schedule, which takes effect October 1, 2023. The new schedule is described in [Child Care Bulletin No. 23-22](#).

Dr. Jaime-Mileham concluded with the observation that “... this work cannot be done alone. ECPC voices continue to be heard by the administration and I want to just make sure that we just continue to express our gratitude for this historic work that we are doing together.”

For more information about CDSS, visit the [Child Care and Development Division website](#) or [join the CDSS listserv](#) to receive CCDD updates.

**Director Johnson** thanked Dr. Jaime-Mileham for her presentation. She then invited questions from the Council.

### Council Questions

The full text of the Council discussion is captured on pages 12 – 16 of the [ECPC transcript](#).

**Deborah Corley-Marzett** advocated for a permanent funding stream to sustain the new CCPU contract items such as health benefits, retirement, trust fund, and training fund. She thanked Dr. Jaime-Mileham and Director Johnson for highlighting the state's investments in Early Childhood providers and declared support for the providers and families CCPU serves.

**Robin Layton** thanked the public and ECPC members who attend meetings. She expressed gratitude for the inclusion of fee waiver, rate increases, and hold harmless in this year's budget. She described the positive ramifications of these changes and thanked Director Johnson, Sarah Neville-Morgan, and Dr. Jaime-Mileham. “I really appreciate that not only did you listen, you heard, and you transferred what we said, and you communicated that to the powers that be and it really shows and it worked...” She expressed solidarity with Ms. Corley-Marzett’s comment that “Our work is not done.” Ms. Layton proposed the Council draft the ECPC budget request letter to the Governor this fall.

**Director Johnson** thanked Ms. Layton.

**Miren Algorri** reflected on and celebrated the collaborative efforts to secure the CCPU contract and the impact it will have on families.

**Director Johnson** thanked Ms. Algorri.

**Zoila Toma**, an FCC provider, shared her concern about many issues affecting providers. She mentioned the student exodus to TK, challenges with staff retention, and gun violence and safety at schools. Ms. Toma also speculated on the value of professional development certificates for providers operating in a mixed delivery model. As the certificates are not equivalent to college units, she questioned what the benefit is for providers as part of a broader workforce with individuals with degrees. She also asked if certificates help providers to be respected as educated providers and be included in the greater system of care options for families. Additionally, she noted that families want to see providers' education as they do for TK-12 teachers. Saving money on family fees may or may not bring families back to FCC programs when families can go to TK and universal pre-K for free.

**Ms. Ignatius** expressed appreciation for Ms. Toma's comments about unaffordable fees for some families and impacts on enrollments. Feedback at the September Joint Advisory Committees meeting had revealed parental confusion about the new fee schedule.

Further, Ms. Ignatius expressed "when I read the CDSS bulletin around the delinquent fees, I felt like there was a little bit of confusion about whether or not those fees could be collected or not." Ms. Ignatius praised the language used in the California Department of Education (CDE) [Management Bulletin 23-07- Guidance on Family Fees for Fiscal Year 2023-2024](#). She asked what other communication methods might be available for agencies to provide clear information and reinforce what the new fee schedule will be starting October 1.

**Ms. Corley-Marzett** stated her support for producing professional development modules in multiple languages by default. "...Language justice is important ...I (would) like to see more than two languages (English and Spanish) when professional development courses are being developed."

**Director Johnson** thanked Ms. Corley-Marzett.

**Dr. Jaime-Mileham** concurred with Ms. Corley-Marzett's comment on language justice. She confirmed CDSS's goal of producing professional development modules in multiple languages: "CDSS is working on a language access plan and hope to provide you more information in the upcoming sessions..."

Dr. Jaime-Mileham also acknowledged Ms. Toma's concerns about determining the value of certificates of completion, or badging, for online learning modules. "There is a lot of professional growth out there and many of you have continued to take professional growth as well as education credit and etc. ...So agree with what you are saying in every aspect of that work and definitely give me food for thought in regard to future work."



Dr. Jaime-Mileham responded to Ms. Ignatius' concern about communicating with parents about the fee schedule, asking that anyone aware of confusion inform her. "CDSS will continue to think about how to incorporate some messaging to our contractors ...and see what type of supports we can provide... ." With the new schedule effective soon, she also noted that every family "should be receiving a notice of action or should have received a notice of action by now to let them know what the new fees are.... They have certain number of days to appeal and there is a whole due process if they want to do that."

### Selections From Public Comment and Chat

"Parents need access to clear information in regard to the mixed delivery system and their choices."

"Thank you, Zoila Toma, for shedding light on how providers can be considered educators through the mixed delivery system. Many have a bachelor's degree. We offer similar curriculums like the UPK and need those funding streams to stay open. Having modules for education is important, with QRIS sunseting, we need more incentives to continuing education. Thank you all for your efforts."

"For those of us in centers, with around ten families on subsidy each year, we struggle to meet monthly expenses. Our payroll represents an average hourly wage of \$18.00. Will there be state assistance to help us meet expenses without large tuition expenses to full pay families?"

## **Rate and Quality Advisory Panel**

### Status Update

**Director Johnson** provided background on the topic of child care rate and quality, noting that CDSS is in the process of implementing an alternative methodology (AM) to set reimbursement rates for subsidized child care services. CDSS's process includes learnings from other states who have adopted AMs and focused discussions with constituent groups. The Council will include the rate and quality topic in meetings for input.

Director Johnson invited Dr. Jaime-Mileham to provide an update on rate reform.

**Dr. Jaime-Mileham** reported that CDSS continues to make progress towards the historic change to California rate and quality structure. She spotlighting progresses toward implementation and next steps:

- March 2023: CDSS officially requested pre-approval from ACF's Office of Child Care (OCC) to move to an AM to inform subsidy rates. The AM would employ a cost study and cost estimation model to understand the actual cost of delivering child care and early learning programs in the state.
- August 16, 2023: OCC approved California's AM proposal.
- September 2023: the Legislature passed an early childhood education trailer bill (SB 140). The bill requires that CDSS collaborate with the CDE to develop and

conduct an AM. The AM will build on recommendations made by the Rate and Quality Work Group and align with the recommendations made by the Joint Labor Management Committee (JLMC).

Dr. Jaime-Mileham thanked ECPC participants for remaining engaged in ongoing rate reform efforts to inform the CCDF fiscal year 2025-2027 State Plan.

CDSS is currently working with national experts Prenatal to Five Fiscal Strategies (P5) to design and implement the proposed AM. This work done in collaboration with CDE will include consultation and engagement with diverse early child care educators, entities, and partners and parents across the state. P5 and CDSS launched a [Provider Survey](#) in July of 2023, which is available via the P5 website.

P5 and CDSS will also be conducting a cost study and a cost estimation model. The new CCPU MOU outlined important steps regarding timelines:

- July and August 2023: the state and P5 conduct constituent engagement and data collection activities. These activities are intended to inform development of the cost estimation models, incorporating JLMC feedback.
- No later than February 15, 2024: the JLMC uses the provided information for the cost estimation model to define base and enhanced rates to inform the single rate structure. Rates will be subject to mandate public engagement through the State Plan process.
- No later than July 1, 2024: the state submits information supporting the use of the single rate structure and its CCDF State Plan (or amendment to the State Plan) to ACF.
- Within 60 days of ACF approval: the state provides CCPU with an outline of the implementation components for the approved single rate structure.
- Within 90 days of ACF approval: “Rates” and “Cost of Care Plus Rates” sections of the CCPU agreement reopened to negotiate structure of the subsidy rates and associated funding being implemented.

Per SB 140, CDSS must update specific budget subcommittees and the Legislative Analyst’s Office (LAO) regarding the CCDF State Plan and single rate structure by May 15, 2024. CDSS will also:

- Provide the subcommittees and LAO an implementation outline of single rate structure components within 60 days of federal approval of the State Plan
- Assure that the approved single rate structure applies to all child care development programs under CDSS and state preschool programs under CDE.

Some details on rate reform progress are captured on [CDSS Rate Reform Update September 19, 2023 \(Rate Reform\), slide 3](#) and pages 17 – 18 of the [ECPC transcript](#).

Dr. Jaime-Mileham closed with a recap of the September 15 Rates and Quality Advisory Panel meeting. Her full remarks on this topic are on pages 18 – 19 of the [ECPC transcript](#). Dr. Zona Sanchez joined the meeting as a member of the advisory panel. She is a proud family, friend, and neighbor provider caring for her grandchildren and has been an active advocate for many years. Dr. Manuel Pastor, a trend economist who

directs the [USC Equity and Research Institute](#), presented on equity and regional variance.

Collaborator P5 has reported a low response rate to the Provider Survey. It is possible that partners in the field are experiencing survey fatigue. Dr. Jaime-Mileham stated CDSS's goal to reach the highest possibly number of respondents, which relies on everyone taking part in the survey and circulating it to their networks. CDSS and CDE have been working together to promote the survey via flyers with the CDE logo. This marketing effort is "to make sure that preschools understand that this is also for them as well as everyone in the field."

In addition to the Provider Survey, there will be online surveys, input sessions, interviews and ad hoc committees to uplift the community voices.

The next Rate and Quality Advisory Panel meeting is scheduled for November 16, 2023. The Provider Survey itself ends and closes in October 2023.

For more information on rate reform and quality efforts, access the following resources:

- [Rate Reform and Quality page on the CDSS website](#)
- [Purpose of the Rate and Quality Advisory Panel \(Rate Reform, slide 4\)](#)
- [Provider Survey and Input Session information](#)
- [Opportunities to uplift community voices \(Rate Reform, slide 5\)](#)
- [ECPC transcript](#), pages 18 – 19

**Director Johnson** thanked Dr. Jaime-Mileham for her presentation on rate reform and made a call for providers in attendance to participate in the Provider Survey. She noted that their input is needed to help inform the AM: "if we have a low response, what that means is it's not representative of the whole of California as we are looking to change our rate infrastructure...Please make sure your voice is included in the data that we will use to inform us going forward." She then invited questions from the Council.

#### Council Questions

(The full text of Council questions is recorded in pages 19 – 21 of the [ECPC transcript](#).)

**Ms. Toma** expressed concern about the low response rate to the Provider Survey and asked how much longer responses can be submitted.

**Director Johnson** expressed appreciation for Ms. Toma's support.

**Ms. Corley-Marzett** concurred with Ms. Toma's sentiment about the need for participation in the Provider Survey and encouraged providers to fill out the survey. "... Just because you sit in a work group, that's not the survey being filled out. Sitting in a work group is great and informational, but again, we still need you to fill those out."

**Ms. Layton also** encouraged the public to help increase survey participation. She noted the need for data from center-based programs, and shared that a "Please use my

information from last year” form option can reduce the time involved in completing the survey.

**Director Johnson** noted that the Provider Survey is offered in multiple languages.

**Dr. Jaime-Mileham** confirmed October 6, 2023 as the last day to complete the survey.

#### Selections From Public Comment and Chat

“Thank you for mentioning the rate reform survey applies to CSPPs as well. The CDE wants to ensure our state preschools know this work applies to them as well and to make their voices heard by completing the survey. We’ll be sending a reminder email out to our CSPP contractors shortly with this reminder.”

### **Supporting Young Multilingual Learners and Their Families**

#### Panel Discussion

The full presentations slides and remarks of the panel discussion are available:

- [Catalyst California/Early Edge California Supporting Young Multilingual Learners and Their Families \(CC/EEC\) slides](#)
- [CDE Opportunities for All Branch Supporting Young Multilingual Learners and Their Families \(CDE\) slides](#)
- [ECPC transcript](#), pages 21 – 37

**Director Johnson** introduced ECPC member **Carola Oliva-Olson**, Vice President of Early Childhood Studies at EDvance College. She thanked Ms Oliva-Olson for assembling and moderating the panel discussion. She also extended her gratitude to Wiyot Tribal Chairman Ted Hernandez, and all of the panelists.

Director Johnson underscored California’s rich diversity of languages and culture represented by many different groups. Research and experience show that high-quality language experiences at home and elsewhere support brain development. So, keeping that rich multilingual environment and honoring home culture is important and essential.

Panelists, in order of presentations:

- Carolyne Crolotte, Director of Dual Language Learner Programs, Early Edge California
- JunHee Doh, Senior Manager of Early Childhood Policy, Catalyst California
- Sarah Neville-Morgan, Deputy Superintendent, Early Education Division, Opportunities for All Branch, CDE
- Stephen Propheter, Early Education Director, Early Education Division, Opportunities for All Branch, CDE
- Ted Hernandez, Chairman of the Wiyot Tribe and Vice Chairperson, Tribal Child Care Association of California (TCCAC)

- Nicole Baitx-Kennedy, Executive Director, Westminster School District Infant Toddler Spanish Dual Immersion Program
- Ana Herrera, Center-based Educator, Educare Head Start Santa Clara
- Idania Hernandez, Parent Representative

**Ms. Oliva-Olson** opened by noting that the topic of supporting multilingual learners (MLL) or dual language learners (DLL) and their families was identified as a priority by ECPC and members of the public in 2023.

She provided a brief overview of what it means to be an MLL. Children learning two or more languages are learning both how to communicate as well as concepts and skills in each language. MLLs and their families represent a variety of cultures, races, levels of ability, and linguistic backgrounds, includes nonverbal dialects, tribal languages, and vernacular. Young MLLs have the right a learning environment that values their cultural wealth, strengthens their linguistic capital, and leads to academic success. She highlighted the value of the diverse panelists' voices and insights.

She introduced **Carolyn Crolotte** and **JunHee Doh**.

**Carolyn Crolotte** shared context about California's DLLs and MLLs and why it is critical to provide culturally and linguistically affirming care and learning in the earliest years.

Ms. Crolotte provided definitions of linguistic terminology. "We use the term dual language learner or DLL across early learning and care programs. And ed code defines dual language learner children as children whose first language is the language other than English or children who are developing two or more languages, one of which may be English. The state and CDE are moving towards asset-based terminology of multilingual learners that recognizes their unique strengths..."

According to the latest census data, California is home to the nation's largest population of DLL children. At 60 percent of children birth to age five, DLLs represent the large majority of young children in California ([CC/EEC slide 2](#)).

"It's critical to center their strengths and their needs as we design our early learning and care system and must be central to how our policies and investments are designed." Ms. Crolotte emphasized that until recently there was no consistent way of identifying DLLs in California's early learning programs. This made it difficult to "have an accurate picture of the large and growing population of DLL children, and more importantly, to make informed decisions about resource allocations and support needed by these children." The implementation of Assembly Bill 1363 makes California the first state to develop an assets-based process for identifying young DLLs in state preschool programs.

**JunHee Doh** shared her stance that "it's critical that we ground our conversation on the lived experiences of families and their priorities for quality early learning and care." She pointed to the personal story of the parent representative at the start of the meeting. Ms. Doh provided background on Catalyst California's research project [Uplifting Family Voices: Family Engagement in California's Rate & Quality Reform Initiative](#) followed by

key findings. Catalyst California partnered with over 20 community-based organizations across the state in 2022 and engaged around 4,000 families with young children, ages zero to five and a little older via a statewide survey and 14 focus groups that have historically been underrepresented. To determine the focus groups, Catalyst California used indices that consider children’s holistic and whole child needs to identify the state’s highest need communities experiencing compounding barriers ([CC/EEC, slide 3](#)).

Ms. Doh expressed that although *Uplifting Family Voices* was designed to inform California’s Rate Reform and Quality Work Group, the organization believes the findings continue to be critical to the implementation of the MPECL and the related DLL knowledge brief. She summarized select findings from the *Uplifting Family Voice* report stating that “(the data) makes it very clear the value that families place on culturally and linguistically affirming early learning and care” ([CC/EEC, slides 4 – 5](#)).

**Ms. Crolotte** noted that research around dual language development and supporting home language aligns with what families share and request. She specifically highlighting key findings from research by the National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine, which:

- Illuminated the importance of the first five years of life for brain development, including language development.
- Emphasized how the first three years of life are even more critical as a period of growth that sets the foundation for children’s cognitive, social-emotional and language development.
- Corroborated the critical role of home language plays in English development. When children have a strong foundation in their home language, it makes it easier for them to learn English.

DLL children who receive home language support are more likely to match or exceed the academic performance of their monolingual peers. They’re also better able to maintain strong ties with their family and community as well as improve their social, behavioral, and emotional regulation. Conversely, children who do not receive home language support face many challenges in academic achievement and completion and are at risk for language loss and family disconnection, which can be extremely detrimental ([CC/EEC slide 6](#)).

Ms. Crolette shared an [infographic from the U.S. Department of Education’s Office of English Language Acquisition](#) that highlights the cognitive, educational, economic and sociocultural benefits of supporting bilingualism throughout life ([CC/EEC, slide 7](#)). She also highlighted a key takeaway from a recent [LA Times article](#): children can only reap the many benefits of bilingualism when they continue to develop and maintain their home language as they are developing English.

For additional information, visit the [Office of English Language Acquisition’s Multilingual Learning Toolkit](#).

**Ms. Oliva-Olson** thanked Ms. Crolette and Ms. Doh. She went on to say that: “In order to support young DLLs, we need to go beyond change in the classroom. We need to promote policies, especially designed to meet the needs of young DLLs and... build the entire ecosystem to support them.” Ms. Oliva-Olson welcomed **Sarah Neville-Morgan**,

Deputy Superintendent, Opportunities for All Branch, CDE to speak about current state policies that support MLLs.

**Sarah Neville-Morgan** introduced her colleague in attendance, Stephen Propheter, Director, CDE Early Education Division.

Before discussing current state policies and new data collection requirements for California State Preschool Programs (CSPPs), Ms. Neville-Morgan provided background on the [California English Learner Roadmap: Strengthening Comprehensive Educational Policies, Programs and Practices for English Learners \(CA EL Roadmap\)](#). The CA EL Roadmap was adopted by the State Board of Education in 2017 and establishes a coherent vision for the experiences and outcome of MLLs, both DLLs and English learners.

The CA EL Roadmap invites schools, districts, and early education programs to envision how MLLs will “fully and meaningfully access and participate in a 21st century education from early childhood through grade 12 that results in their attaining high levels of English proficiency, mastery of grade level standards, and opportunities to develop proficiency in multiple languages.”

The CA EL Roadmap is grounded in universal pre-K, recognizing “that high-quality early learning and care, as well as families, play a really critical role in language development, especially in those early years.” This echoes an emphasis on assets-oriented perspectives around home language and culture. An appropriate identification of a learner’s strengths and needs continues through to *reclassification*. Reclassification is part of a system that supports students who enter the education speaking limited or no English. Reclassification ensures these students have full access to the educational continuum and curriculum through graduation higher ed and their career opportunities ([CDE, slide 3](#)).

Ms. Neville-Morgan then asked **Stephen Propheter** to describe the Opportunities for All Branch’s work on equity, diversity, and inclusion in supporting MLLs in early childhood.

**Mr. Propheter** stated that supporting MLLs has been a key focus of equity, diversity, and inclusion work at the CDE. One recommendation from the MPELC was to create equitable learning and focus on supporting MLLs in their early childhood education.

Mr. Propheter then provided a status update on the implementation of AB 1363, signed by the Governor in October of 2021. The purpose of the bill is to develop a systematic approach for educators to identify and support multilingual children in state preschools. Mr. Propheter summarized progress on DLL identification efforts. With support from the UPK research design team and partners such as Early Edge, Catalyst California and First 5, the CDE developed a standardized process for CSPP contractors to:

- Better identify children learning multiple languages
- Support relationship building with families of children who are identified as multilingual learners
- Learn more about each child’s experiences with language

According to Mr. Propheter, “The implementation of this bill is helping California move to a more inclusive and equitable UPK system, by ensuring that we can collect the necessary data and information to better support DLLs as well as to address barriers to multilingual program models.” He went on to identify additional CDE resources, including [a guidance bulletin](#), an [MLL support website](#), and a [three-part DLL support webinar series](#) on topics derived from external partners in the field.

Mr. Propheter discussed the importance of data collection and the tools used for DLL identification. The identification process is beneficial for teachers, children, and families. The *Family Language Instrument* and the *Family Language and Interest Interview* help providers and educators learn more about a child’s language, background, strengths, and interests.

To support CSPP contractors with the costs of supporting DLLs, the Legislature increased the DLL adjustment factor to 1.2. This means that a contractor receives 20% above the base rate for DLL children. Funds can be used to cover the cost of the Management Bulletin requirements and providing needed supports as identified in family interviews. At the preschool level, educators may need more developmentally appropriate materials in the target language. They may also need professional learning to prepare them to provide hands-on experiences that aid in building language. AB 1363 also requires contractors to report MLL data to the CDE, as well as the preschool program. The goal of this data reporting is to improve program quality and to support informed decision-making at the state and local level ([CDE, slide 5](#)).

Mr. Propheter stated programs have reported benefiting from the language identification process programs. Previously, the CDE did not have rich data on children’s language prior to entering the TK-12 system. Now the data exists, “and we will be able to use it to better understand and support the children we serve.”

For additional information on the DLL identification and MLL supports, access the following resources:

- [Early Edge California’s CA’s DLL Identification Process Helps Teachers Support Young Children & their Families video \(English\)](#)
- [Early Edge California’s CA’s DLL Identification Process Helps Teachers Support Young Children & their Families video \(Spanish\)](#)
- [Example AB 393 Letter of Support](#)
- [Resources for Pre-K-3 on the Multilingual Toolkit website.](#)

**Ms. Neville-Morgan** expressed appreciation to everyone in the DLL and MLL space who is strengthening those assets and “...holding up California, as not just a national, but an international powerhouse in this area....” She stated that the efforts are preparing California’s children to compete in an international market. She closed by highlighting the significance of partnership with students’ families.

**Ms. Oliva-Olson** thanked Ms. Neville-Morgan and Mr. Propheter and expressed enthusiasm to learn what future data will indicate. She then welcomed the remaining panelists and asked them to speak to the following prompts:



- What community do they serve?
- What does supporting multilingual learning look like in their programs?
- What impact has multilingual learning had on children, families, and the community?

**Ted Hernandez**, Chairman of the Wiyot Tribe, began by offering a greeting in his community's traditional language. He described the continuity of Indigenous languages in America, emphasizing the multi-faceted role of language in his community: "It's an honor for me to be here today to speak about language. After hearing all these presentations, it's been pretty amazing because for the Indigenous communities here, first I just want to state that the English language was not the first language here in America. It was Indigenous people's language that was here first. And that is where we stand as Indigenous people, is to continue to teach our younger generation the language, the stories and the songs. Because language... it's who we are, it's what make us a Wiyot people. Our language is a part of our prayers, our songs, our ceremonies."

Chairman Hernandez explained that his community's language loss came out of elders being taken to boarding schools where Indigenous language was not allowed. Now, there are ongoing efforts to relearn the language from archival sources and teach future generations. "For the Wiyot people, we had tremendous tragedy in our lifetimes, but our healing processes is by teaching and moving forward. And having our children know our language, having the children know the songs and the stories, because when we do ceremonies, they have to know our language when they sing their songs. And they have to know their language when they tell those stories about why this ceremony is important. So, it's important for them to learn."

He detailed the structure of his community's multilingual program and the familial language learning taking place: "We are so tremendously blessed to have our linguist Lynnika Butler, who is helping us bring back our language and our children learn our language. She works with our children in our center two days a week so the children can take the language home and learn with their parents. So, not just the children's learning, but the parents are learning as well. The children are taking stories home and they're reading to their parents these stories and language. And the parents are picking the language up as well."

Chairman Hernandez summarized the reason why his community pursues multilingualism: "...All the Indigenous people have been here since time immemorial. We just had to adopt to the English language. ...And it's also important that the children are multilingual because there is a lot that's happening in this world. A lot of things are changing that they need to know, and they need to speak because we as older generations, we don't do that. But it's going to be the seventh generations that are going to continue this for us."

**Ms. Oliva-Olson** thanked Chairman Hernandez. She invited **Nicole Baitx-Kennedy** to speak.

**Ms. Baitx-Kennedy**, Executive Director, Westminster School District Infant Toddler Spanish Dual Immersion Program described the language makeup of her the district. The Westminster district is predominantly English, Vietnamese, and Spanish. There are two dual language programs in the district: an elementary Spanish program and the first elementary-level Vietnamese dual language program in the state. Middle school-level programs for both languages are in the works. They have also started dual Spanish program at the infant/toddler level. The district is working hard to have dual language and multilanguage classrooms and programs including their preschool and infant/toddler program.

Ms. Baitx-Kennedy shared her community's vision for DLLs and MMLs: "...our children need to have that ability to be empowered to show who they are and where they're going. And that's what we want, and it is what's best for all of our children and to build that strong foundation."

**Ms. Oliva-Olson** thanked Ms. Baitx-Kennedy noting that she has visited the Westminster School District's and was always impressed. Ms. Oliva-Olsen then invited **Ana Herrera** to speak.

**Ms. Herrera** is a center-based educator at Educare Head Start Santa Clara. She began by offering a snapshot of her past experience as a lead teacher in a multilingual preschool classroom serving children who speak Vietnamese, Spanish and English. She explained that she is bilingual in Spanish and English and worked alongside colleagues who were Spanish-English and Vietnamese-English bilingual. She detailed the intentional strategies that they employed to wholistically support their students and connect with their families.

Her team observed pride in their students: "We noticed that children are all learning, and they feel proud. What was the most important part? That they feel proud about who they are and their families." Furthermore, her team reported seeing stronger intergenerational communication within families and a desire by families to continue enrolling their children in dual language education such as immersion schools.

Ms. Herrera shared that she carries learnings from Educare Head Start in her current coaching role: "I am able to support all classrooms to improve their teaching and ensuring their influence, all DL teaching and strategies, and collaborate with families... it's a pleasure for me to share this with other teachers, with all other colleagues, to share and continue the work to support those dual language children for a better future and education in life. We all commit to this work."

**Ms. Oliva-Olson** thanked Ms. Herrera. She invited **Idania Hernandez** to speak.

**Ms. Hernandez** shared her experience as a bilingual child and a parent to four bilingual children: "I am Mexican born but brought here as a child. I was brought here when I was five, so I had to learn English myself. I went to a dual language immersion school... as a parent, I was very proud to have my children go to a bilingual school and continue to learn their second language, which for us is English, because Spanish is our primary language." She noted that her daughter was "fortunate to go to Educare...and had the privilege of having Ms. Herrera and Ms. Tammy as teachers."

She shared that she saw a significant positive impact of a multilingual (English, Spanish, and Vietnamese) environment on her daughter's sense of culture and social-emotional learning.

**Ms. Oliva-Olson** thanked Ms. Hernandez and recapped themes emerging from the diverse stories of multilingual education programs and MLLs:

- Centering children
- Collaborating with families
- Delivering micro- and macro-level supports (programmatic, communities, district, state, and beyond)

She acknowledged the panelists' knowledge: "We need to learn from all of you. We continue to work hard to spread the word, to learn together, to build infrastructure in institutions of higher ed, building capacity..." She then invited Ms. Doh and Ms. Crolette to discuss what policies or solutions could further support this.

**Ms. Doh** pointed to the MPELC's relevance to multilingual education. She also noted that AB 1363 is being implemented in state preschools now. She specifically pointed to the importance ensuring proper implementation and using the *Family Language Instrument and Family Language and Interest Interview* to build stronger partnerships with families.

Ms. Doh highlighted the prospect of AB 393 being signed and reinforcement of the MPELC's recommendations around DLL identification: "if signed, that will expand asset-based identification of DLLs to general child care and migrant child care programs." Early Edge California has provided a [sample letter of support for AB 393](#).

She stressed the value of assets-based practices around language identification in early education. Finally, Ms. Doh stated that critical opportunity to center DLLs by ensuring P-3 alignment infrastructure includes an explicit focus on supporting DLL needs.

For more information about goals and strategies related to DLLs on the [MPELC website](#).

**Ms. Crolotte** thanked the panelists for presenting on their work in the field and key policies that are needed in support of DLLs. She reminded attendees why it is so important to support DLLs and their families: "DLLs represent a majority of the children in California. So it's really critical that the early learning and care workforce have the tools and resources and training to really support these children's, not only bilingual development, but overall development." She shared upcoming opportunities to inform policy around DLLs and MLLs including a Child Development Permit Workgroup, staff training and professional development, and institutions of higher education developing a PK-3 Early Childhood Education Specialist Instruction Credential.

**Ms. Oliva-Olson** thanked Ms. Crolette and opened the floor for questions from the Council.

#### Council Discussion

The full record of Council discussion can be found on pages 37 – 46 of the [ECPC transcript](#).

**Dr. Jaime-Mileham** thanked the panel noting that the DLL topic “is always dear to my heart, not only because I myself am a dual language learner, but also can say concretely that I consider myself a champion in expanding the affirmation of culturally and linguistically practices across our entire mixed delivery system.” She recognized that many of the practices discussed for center-based environments “also exist naturally in our family, friend and neighbor care as well as the family child care home settings.” She expressed concern about a lack of tools available to identify asset-based practices that exist in FFN and licensed FCC care. “The result could create a narrative that this doesn’t exist in these settings.”

Dr. Jaime-Mileham shared her own family’s language journey, including the impact of DLL on her now-adult daughter’s language development, identity, and socioemotional growth. She voiced support for deepening understanding and resources: “I invite us to have more information in regard to how to create those tools that are strength-based that live within all our sectors, to make sure that we are understanding that language preservation is the priority of this. And, as we continue to do this work in California’s system and building on it, we definitely need to address this gap as we are then taking the next step of targeting professional development approaches.”

**Dean Tagawa** shared a conversation he had while visiting a Los Angeles Unified School District’s (LAUSD) DLL program. In the exchange, a mother revealed the generational benefits of the program on her family.

Mr. Tagawa thanked Dr. Jaime-Mileham for spotlighting FFNs “because a lot of times, our families do feel comfortable in those situations. So that’s an opportunity for the kids to develop from the very beginning (of) their language skills.” He advocated for continuing to “myth bust” the idea that dual language learning confuses children, pointing to the fact that “there are so many different ways to ... build the confidence in the kids as they develop both languages....”

He reported that the LAUSD has 39 different dual language programs in early education (CSPPs, EECs, and UTKs) beginning with the Seal of Literacy. “It is starting its fourth cohort. And they’re in our early education centers, our state preschool programs, our universal transitional kindergarten programs. LASUD makes sure that the kids have a feeder pattern as they go into elementary school, so they can continue that.”

**Ms. Baitx-Kennedy** congratulated LAUSD. She stated her belief that priorities for MLL education include hiring high-quality early education teachers and support staff, as well as establishing culturally sound programs.

She called for increased compensation for DLL and MLL educators, recognizing the amount of work they do. She emphasized that she is proactively working to lessen obstacles between the Westminister School District programs and local education agencies. Ms. Baitx-Kennedy identified several types of opportunities to address barriers:

- Funding professional development
- Setting up frameworks

- Creating pathways to cross-utilize learning tools to support children in all care and education programs
- Expanding types of educators and programs

**Mary Ignatius** thanked all who work in the MLL space and shared a story from her family’s experience illustrating how attitudes about language education have evolved: “I am the daughter of immigrants from India. And both my brothers, when they immigrated, they were school age—first grade and third grade—and spoke two main languages in India. But they were met in the late seventies with an education system that did not embrace multilingualism. And my mom was sent home letters from teachers that said, ‘Stop speaking your home language, because your children are going to be behind.’ And then when I came along a few years later, I didn’t learn the language. And so it was felt as if it was a deficit or a weakness to speak this language, when in fact, and research shows, it’s a superpower.”

She expressed gratitude for the research and practitioners who endeavor to keep contemporary childrens’ home languages intact.

**Donna Sneeringer** expressed support for Ms. Ignatius’s sentiment.

**Ms. Ignatius** further shared her perception of how research promoting multilingualism has led to families now competing for DLL programs: “It’s now created this almost competition. And families who have more resources and privilege to understand how to navigate to get into programs are almost jumping in front of children and families who that is their real home language.... Is anyone studying that or researching that? Or is there any prioritization for children and families who that home language really is at home and not something that they were exposed to with a nanny or something like that?”

**Ms. Oliva-Olson** noted that California uses many approaches to support all languages. CDE, agencies, and foundations deliver professional development so all teachers, regardless of the languages that they speak, can support every single child’s home language: “It doesn’t mean they’re going to teach in that home language, but they will support the home language so that they can make connections with what they’re learning and develop concepts and skills. And we are not waiting until they have enough English language skills, that’s one side. The other one is that they’re continuing to develop their home language, the teachers bridge with that home language and support families in continuing the use of that family language for all the benefits that we know exist.”

**Ms. Crolotte** thanked Ms. Ignatius for her story. She said that Catalyst and Californians Together—who were instrumental in advocating for new funding for DLL program expansion—advocate for prioritization for DLLs and English learners. This is coupled with family engagement and communications about the benefits of bilingualism and the importance of the home language. The goal is to rectify the rhetoric of, “For my child to be successful, they need English, English only.”

**Ms. Neville-Morgan** explained that there is an emphasis on program models with a certain percentage of children with a home language other than English, however, the

model does not exclude English-only students. “(The program model) emphasizes having native speakers and children from that culture as a critical part. But it does also mean you are bringing children for whom that isn’t their first language because there has to be that balance in the program.”

**Donna Sneeringer** reflected on the presentations and posed several questions about what is and can be done to understand and support multilingual education provided by early childhood providers:

- “What are we doing as a support system in the state to support our FFN and FCC givers as they support multilingualism?”
- “What are we doing to collect information about the multicultural services that are happening in birth to three and then articulating that to our partners in public education so they can be more prepared for communities that are evolving?”
- “What policy work could be done to support providers in supporting multilingual education?”
- “What can be done to have a more integrated approach to how we look at collecting data and building better systems across CDSS and CDE?”

**Dr. Jaime-Mileham** said that AB 393, currently awaiting the Governor’s signature, is a vehicle to collect data and would include the Title V portion of CDSS programs. The next ECPC meeting will include an update on that. She also stated that the State Plan should include ideas for outreach across the mixed delivery system. She identified some current investments, including “the language lab that is in Fresno that is currently supporting and also is training R&Rs across the state” so they can provide trainings to FFN and FCC providers.

Dr. Jaime-Mileham returned to Ms. Corley-Marzett’s earlier point about considering all languages for online professional development modules.

**Natali Gaxiola** shared from her experiences as a student and as a teacher for 20 years. She highlighted her belief that intertwining culture and asset-based language education enlarges one’s experience. She agreed with Ms. Ignatius’ comment about the perception of one’s full language experience being “taken away” in past generations.

Ms. Gaxiola noted that there is an abundance of professional development available to preschool providers, but she would like to see more opportunity for collaboration and knowledge sharing. She speculated if a space for collaboration is possible.

**Ms. Oliva-Olson** acknowledged Ms. Gaxiola’s comment on support for educators noting the topic can be an agenda item for the Council’s consideration at a future meeting.

**Miren Algorri** praised the presentation as relatability to her experiences as an immigrant, mother, and early childhood educator. She noted the importance of thinking about children’s futures “and what great assets that they will become being multilingual,” especially as it is contrasted with what they could have lost.

Ms. Algorri advocated for continued investment in bilingual and multilingual children. She underscored the need for the AM and for providers input via the survey. She also inquired about American Rescue Plan Act funding as it relates to families and needs of state's childhood educators and asked how is going to be allocated.

**Dr. Jaime-Mileham** stated that CDSS is currently ready to offer another stipend in the amount of \$275 a month. CDSS will provide more information in a Child Care Bulletin.

**Director Johnson** expressed appreciation for the panelists' presentations and highlighted the importance and power of connection: "I just want to also lift up that it is a connection to family and culture and community and that we named the history where it was either unintentionally or intentionally taken away or lost for those opportunities."

**Ms. Oliva-Olson** thanked everyone for productive and though-provoking discussion and presentations.

**Karin Bloomer** moved the group to public comment.

#### Selections From Public Comment and Chat

The full record of public comment can be found on pages 46 – 48 of the [ECPC transcript](#).

"I was on the workforce group for the Commission for Teacher Credentialing and definitely we talked about collaboration and as an educator and preschool director it is key to success. I love including Multilanguage in the Permit process."

"Thanks to CDE, DSS and the ECPC for your leadership in supporting DLLs/multilingual learners and their families. Early Edge is looking forward to continuing our work together on implementing AB 1363 and expanding supports to other programs and providers."

"Thank you for these important conversations. In terms of how to enhance and support multilingual opportunities and education CDE CSPP programs receive additional funding to serve multilingual students. The same increase should be given to CDSS CCTR programs serving our youngest multilingual learners. This will help recruit and retain staff that are multilingual in these programs."

"I wish we could have the same kind of social-emotional/asset based/cultural wealth respect for Black children. Newsom has been unwilling to provide targeted support to Black children and the push back against reparations and equity across the nation is clear and deeply felt."

"Our program is suffering because we are not bilingual, however, employment for our English speakers seems like it will be an issue. How can we merge with multi languages with just English speakers? Our competition has grown, and our program is suffering to stay open."

"It would be great if you could revisit the stipends and tuition support for native speakers to earn degrees and certifications. Teachers need to reflect the languages and cultures of the people."

“...when I chose where to leave my son at such a young age was not only someone with a DL program because by experience, I know the value of being multilingual...but it was utterly important to have someone that would sooth his anxiety and PTSD. Mental Health at such a young age of 2 and 3 is not often spoken about. The DL Head Start program effectively decreased his episodes from when he began at 18 months to when he was ready to start Kinder. I would love to see a study that looks into the clear benefits in Mental Health due to DL programs. It is a proven side effect that needs to be brought into the conversation to educate parents.”

“I just wanted to be a representative for the African American students that are being left behind and seem like forgot about. We don't even have a seat at the table there representing our culture. I work with students helping them read and math because the afterschool program at the schools, they just let them play afterschool program and I can't even get help for my afterschool program. It's all volunteer work. I have to do it. So that's why I wanted to just bring that up to remember the African American students as well because we don't have any language or anything. You know what I mean? We kind of lost from our culture. So yeah, just don't forget about us. Like I said, we don't even have anybody there sitting at the table representing us.”

“We are an English speaking program, play-based program. And our biggest competitor are language immersion programs. Our community of parents, they love our program, but that is the number one program where families leave. But we are having a hard time because that's not what our program has been built on. And so most of our teachers only speak English. ... it's already hard enough to hire teachers with experience and credentials to be in the classroom, let alone multilanguage speakers. So just wondering some resources so we can survive and not have to shut down eventually because this is the way of the future.

“I am daycare provider, and I am in Santa Clara County. ...I'm daycare provider since 20 years. After Covid, we are just struggling to survive. I had, whenever I go here and there meeting with the congressman, meeting with the mayor, meeting with that county, they have in waiting list, parents are waiting 2000 voucher to find that daycare provider. And I know so many provider, I can give the data even. All provider, at least like the I know 20 or 30 provider, they have very low enrollment. Then where are the voucher, where our parents are going, why they are not finding even their Santa Clara County resource and referral. They are not providing any information. Where to go, how to go. All the daycare provider just running around asking each other and nobody knows what to do. So my question is who will help to daycare provider.”

“I'm a parent of two young kids. They all go to family-based daycare. So I'm speaking right now for the daycare because they're busy taking care of our kids. I think their concern is regarding the definition of the infant in California, the definition of the infant is two years old. While according to the care provider, they think it's more proper to define the infant as one year old or 14 months. And we check together all these federal codes and rules and other states, they all define the infant as what, 12 months or 14 months. So we would like to know is there any process we can follow to submit the kind of a review request...”



**Director Johnson** queried the Council on Ms. Layton's proposal for the body to develop a budget advisory letter of recommendations for the Council's review at the December meeting. She stated that it requires two members to develop a draft and to reach out to Karin Bloomer if interested.

She expressed appreciation for the Council and public engagement noting that the panel conversation yielded additional questions for follow up. The next ECPC meeting scheduled for December 21, and details will be posted on [the ECPC website](#).

Meeting adjourned.