Research about Black Families to Advance Early Care and Education Policy and Practice

Chrishana M. Lloyd, LICSW, PhD

June 21, 2022
AGENDA

- Purpose and Background
- Overview of Black Families' Cultural Assets
- Black Family Trends and Shifts
- Implications & Next Steps
CONVERSATION GOALS

GOAL #1
Understand themes in historical and contemporary research and demographic trends and shifts related to Black families with children.

GOAL #2
Understand how to think about and use research and data to inform the development of policies and practices that have the potential to shape early care and education practices and strengthen Black families with children.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Historical Research Perspectives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Perspective #1**
Black families are disorganized, pathological, and unstable, in large part because of their history of enslavement in the United States.

**Perspective #2**
Black family challenges are a result of living within a society that is affected by historical and structural issues such as systemic racism, oppression, and discrimination, and family strengths help to navigate these barriers.

**Perspective #3**
Black families experience structural racism as a result of the country's history, but may react to and attend to these issues differently based on income, social standing, or other factors.
HISTORICAL EXPRESSION OF BLACK FAMILIES’ CULTURAL ASSETS
HISTORICAL EXPRESSION OF BLACK FAMILY CULTURAL ASSETS

EXTENDED KIN AND SOCIAL NETWORKS
Extended kin and social networks refer to close ties among Black family members—especially among consanguineal (blood) relatives and among friends integrated into the family as “fictive” or voluntary kin.

OPTIMISM
Optimism refers to “the penetrating belief held by most Black families that conditions will improve.”

RELIGIOSITY AND SPIRITUALITY
Religiosity and spirituality refer to the role of faith and a belief in and connection to a higher power that is external from the individual.

ROLE FLEXIBILITY
Role flexibility refers to the idea that an individual’s responsibilities in a family adapt and change based on circumstances and/or need.
BLACK FAMILY TRENDS AND SHIFTS
BLACK FAMILY TRENDS AND SHIFTS

An increase in the number of individuals identifying as Black, including those who are multiracial.

A rise in different types of family structures.

Growth in the number of Black immigrants.

Differentials between Black men and women in interracial marriage rates.
BLACK FAMILY TRENDS AND SHIFTS

1. Changes in religious worship preferences for younger generations of Black people
2. Varied religious preferences among Black immigrant populations
3. Shifts in the residential locations of Black people
4. Improved educational attainment, moderate incomes, and low levels of wealth for Black people living in America
IMPLICATIONS AND NEXT STEPS
CONCEPTUAL MODEL GUIDING THE CHILD TRENDS APPLIED RESEARCH AGENDA ON BLACK FAMILIES WITH CHILDREN

Federal policies

State policies

Local policies

Systems

Examples:
- Child welfare
- Early care and education
- Education
- Housing
- Health care
- Political and legal systems
- Workforce and career

Black families with children

Institutions and organizations

Examples:
- Child care
- School
- Clinic
- Court

Note: A solid arrow (→) represents a stronger level of influence than a dashed arrow (↔)
MAINTAIN A CURIOUS AND CRITICAL STANCE ABOUT RESEARCH AND DATA ON BLACK FAMILIES THAT ARE USED TO INFORM PROGRAM POLICIES AND PRACTICES

- Data sets do not adequately capture race and ethnicity
- There is limited inclusion of strengths-based variables in large-scale data sets, including those relevant to specific cultural assets
- It is challenging to compare across existing data sets
EXAMINE ASSUMPTIONS AND BIASES—INCLUDING HOW PERSONAL EXPERIENCES, VALUES, AND ORGANIZATIONAL CULTURES MAY AFFECT APPROACHES TO COLLECTING DATA, PROVIDING SERVICES, AND MAKING POLICIES.

• Use frameworks that combat anti-Black racism in policy

• Dedicate the time and resources to critically think, question and reflect on biases, experiences values and cultures
ENSURE THAT ANALYSIS PROCESSES IN EARLY CARE AND EDUCATION PROGRAMS AND POLICY ARE STRENGTHS BASED AND ASSET FOCUSED.

- Utilize a non-comparative lens when planning research, programs and policies for Black families
- Include, investigate and report on intra and inter-family context
THANK YOU

Chrishana M. Lloyd
Research Scholar
Child Trends

clloyd@childtrends.org
Black Californians
UNITED FOR
Early Care & Education

We are a powerful coalition intentionally organizing our influence to serve California’s young Black children and their families.
We Recognize

Stolen Land

Stolen Labor

We live on stolen land in a country that has built a legacy on stolen labor.
The beginning of child care in America
And it continued
And then there was my Nana
Who We Are

Black Californians United for Early Care and Education (BCUECE) is a powerful coalition of:

- Advocates
- Policy-Influencers
- Civil Rights Organizations
- Researchers
- University Faculty
- Early care and education (ECE) professionals
- Caregivers/providers
- Families
- Community-Based Organizations
- Nonprofit Leaders
Black Overcoming

The BCUECE policy framework intends to disrupt and abolish over 400 years of purposely designed institutionalized racism.

The Legacy of Childcare

- The child care system is rooted in the legacy of enslaved Black women.
- Our education system was founded on racial hierarchies and social constructs that underserve and underrepresent people of African descent.
Where We Want to Go

Our 10-Point Policy Plan holds California accountable for its participation in causing racial harm in the early learning system.

- We demand a Black “whole child,” whole family,” “whole ECE workforce,” and “whole community” approach. We will no longer tolerate a generalized approach to the needs of Black ECE constituents.
- We demand a shift that results in California using policies and resources to address anti-Blackness in its structures while also investing in, affirming and advancing the cultural assets of Black people.
Our 10-Point Policy Plan

Black Children:

1. We want Black families to have options to choose from when determining which setting will work best for their children.

2. We want Black children to receive an additional $500 in their CalKids account.

3. We want Black children to be engaged in culturally affirming care and education.
Our 10-Point Policy Plan

Black Families:

4. We want Black families with varying experiences to be intentionally included in state-level input convenings and working groups.

5. We want Black advisories established and adequately funded at the local, county, and state level.

6. We want basic universal income for Black families, especially women and mothers.
Our 10-Point Policy Plan

Black ECE Workforce:

7. We want Black early educators to receive stipend payments to address the racial wage gap.

We want a pipeline for Black educators to work across settings, job roles, and to provide Black children access to Black caregivers and educators.

8. We want state grants and contracts for early care and education services to prioritize independently and Black-owned ECE programs.
Our 10-Point Policy Plan

10 REPARATIONS!

Unfinished business

Yesterday is already too late and tomorrow is not soon enough knowing every day Black children in California lack equitable opportunities to thrive academically and socially.
Entrenched Oppression

Racism and oppression have long been part of the legacy of child care

- **Enslaved Black women:** our nation’s first child care providers, were forced to care for White children with priority over their own
- **Domestic workers:** Black women shifted from one form of oppression to another, and were joined by Native, Immigrant and other women of color
- **Training Opportunities:** Early distinctions between White women engaged in nursery school education and training to ensure Black women had the skills to take care of White children and families
Entrenched Oppression

Roots of oppression run deep in current child care system

- **Racialized pay penalties:** in California, Black educators experience poverty at double that of their peers; in Marin County center-based teachers of color paid $6,136/yr less than their White peers

- **Racialized opportunities:** Most early educators in California are women of color and immigrant women, yet the majority of center directors are White women

- **Systems reinforce oppression:** QRIS rewards inequitable distribution of resources, punishes scarcity; CA Master Plan excludes recommendations to address basic needs of workforce and racial inequities
Economic Insecurity & Disparities

98% of other occupations are paid more than child care workers

8x is how much higher the rate of poverty is for early educators when compared to K-8 teachers

$4,406 is the wage gap between Black center-based teachers and their peers; a wage gap persist across levels of education

$9,542 is the wage gap between infant and toddler teachers with a bachelor’s degree and their peers working with preschool age children; Black educators are more likely to work with infants and toddlers

Sources: Early Childhood Workforce Index - 2020; CSCCE analysis of NSECE 2019 | © Center for the Study of Child Care Employment
### California’s ECE Workforce

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Racial/Ethnic Identity</th>
<th>FCC</th>
<th>Center Teaching Staff</th>
<th>Center Directors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Black</strong></td>
<td><strong>12%</strong></td>
<td><strong>5%</strong></td>
<td><strong>6%</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latina</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiethnic</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Demographics of the California ECE Workforce (2022) | © Center for the Study of Child Care Employment
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1/3</td>
<td>Of family child care providers in California were behind on rent or mortgage payments; among Black FCC providers 42% had been unable to pay.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43%</td>
<td>Of family child care providers were unable to pay themselves; 31% took on credit card debt to cover program costs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1/3</td>
<td>Of family child care providers and center teachers experienced food insecurity. Educators of color, immigrants, and those who were unpartnered were most impacted.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&lt; 15%</td>
<td>Of family child care providers and center teachers would be able to pay for a $400 emergency expense without assuming debt.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: “The Forgotten Ones”—The Economic Well-Being of Early Educators During COVID-19
Centering Black Educators in Change
Questions? Please get in touch.

Lea J.E. Austin | laustin@berkeley.edu