



**California Health & Human Services Agency
Center for Data Insights and Innovation
Data Exchange Framework Stakeholder Advisory Group
Meeting Summary
Wednesday, November 10, 2021, 10:00 a.m. to 12:30 p.m.**

Attendance

Stakeholder Advisory Group Members in attendance: Jamie Almanza, Ashrith Amarnath, Charles Bacchi, Nancy Bargmann, Andrew Bindman, Michelle Doty Cabrera, Scott Christman, David Cowling, Carmela Coyle, Joe Diaz, Rahul Dhawan, Kayte Fisher, David Ford, Liz Gibboney, Michelle Gibbons, Lori Hack, Cameron Kaiser, Andrew Kiefer, Linnea Koopmans, Matt Legé, David Lindeman, Amanda McAllister-Wallner, DeeAnne McCallin, Ali Modaresi, Dana E. Moore, Erica Murray, Nathan Nau, Janice O'Malley, Mark Savage, Kiran Savage-Sangwan, Linette Scott, Cathy Senderling-McDonald, Claudia Williams, Leslie Witten-Rood, William York.

Stakeholder Advisory Group Staff and Presenters in attendance: Rim Cothren (Independent HIE Consultant to CDII), Jonah Frohlich (Manatt Health Strategies), Kevin McAvey (Manatt Health Strategies), John Ohanian (CalHHS/CDII), Khuoa Vang (CalHHS/CDII).

Public in attendance: approximately 163 public attendees joined this meeting via Zoom video conference or through call-in functionality.

Meeting Notes

Meeting notes elevate points made by presenters, Stakeholder Advisory Group Members, and public commenters during the Data Exchange Framework Stakeholder Advisory Group meeting. Notes may be revised to reflect public comment received in advance of the next Stakeholder Advisory Group meeting. Meeting materials, full video recording, transcription, and public comments may be found at:

<https://www.chhs.ca.gov/data-exchange-framework/>.

Welcome and Roll Call

John Ohanian, Chief Data Officer, California Health & Human Services, welcomed attendees and shared that Dr. Mark Ghaly, Secretary, California Health & Human Services would unfortunately not be able to attend due to an unforeseen COVID-related conflict. Stakeholder Advisory Group Members were named and introduced via roll call.

Vision and Meeting Objectives

John Ohanian welcomed Stakeholder Advisory Group Members and the public to the third CHHS Data Exchange Framework Stakeholder Advisory Group meeting. He reviewed CalHHS' guiding principles and strategic priorities, before describing the scenario an individual with complex needs might face to improving their health and wellbeing, both before and after California implements its data exchange framework.

He concluded by reiterating the vision for data exchange in California and the meeting's objectives.

Advisory Group Members noted that the scenario should reference the important role health plans play in facilitating health care connections.

Principles of Data Exchange in California

John Ohanian described the Data Exchange Framework development process, the purpose of Data Exchange Framework guiding principles, how the principles were developed, and the six principles that were developed for Stakeholder Advisory Group consideration. Stakeholder Advisory Group Members broadly agreed with the principles as drafted, though shared the feedback that included, but was not limited to:

- All of the principles should:
 - Include a greater level of detail to more effectively guide solution development and solution implementation; a separate “operating” principles could be developed to complement the current set.
 - Acknowledge the central role of the consumer/patient, reflecting the priorities put forward in the scenarios.
 - Note the urgency of the need, and how we should start by leveraging and building upon what presently exists in the market, instead of holding for additional system reforms before expanding data exchange.
- Principle 1, Advancing Health Equity, should:
 - Speak to the importance of fill data gaps around race, gender, and sexual orientation to address health inequities.
 - Reinforce the need to have a system that can effectively match patient records and consolidate patient information.
 - Acknowledge the need to strengthen payer and provider access to data that can be used to better understand and advance health equity.
- Principle 2, Make Data Available to Drive Decisions and Outcomes, should:
 - Acknowledge that data needs to be usable in addition to being shared or made available.
- Principle 4, Reinforce Patient Access, Privacy, and Security, should:
 - Be split into two principles, one focused on Patient Access, another and Patient Data Privacy and Security.
 - Ensure alignment with existing federal and state law.
- Principle 5, Adhere to Data Exchange Standards, should:
 - Reference which data exchange standards must be adhered to in developing the Data Exchange Framework.¹
 - Ensure alignment with TEFCA.

¹ Full meeting transcript available on CalHHS' DxF [website](#).

Public Comment

John Ohanian opened the meeting to public comment, which included:²

- Allen Noriega, who emphasized the importance of considering health equity holistically across programs and populations and voiced support for considering individuals as part of the Data Exchange Framework.
- Kristine Toppe, Assistant Vice President for State Affairs, National Committee for Quality Assurance (NCQA), who voiced support for the work being conducted by CalHHS and the Stakeholder Advisory Group, and noted that NCQA has potentially similar work underway related to promoting digital measures, measures that use data housed in a health information exchange, and other mechanisms to streamline reporting and make most efficient use of data. Kristine also noted that, as part of the Healthcare Effectiveness Data and Information Set (HEDIS) measures, NCQA is advocating for primary race and ethnicity data collection from individuals.

Barriers to Data Exchange in California

Jonah Frohlich, Managing Director, Manatt Health Strategies, described how the scenario discussion during the previous Stakeholder Advisory Group meeting surfaced successes of and barriers to data exchange in California. Jonah explained that gaps may impact one or more scenarios, and that the barriers can be grouped into three categories: technical infrastructure and standards; financing and business operations; and regulatory and policy. Jonah then reviewed the major barriers in each of the categories.

Stakeholder Advisory Group Members generally agreed with the barriers that were identified and suggested the following additions:

- Technical and business operations barriers for consumer access to their medical records.
- Technical and business operation barriers to improving quality and usability of health equity data (e.g., race, ethnicity, disability, sexual orientation, gender identify), disability data, and SDOH data.
- Continuing technological and workforce challenges to facilitating electronic health information exchange across and among health care organizations, human service organizations, and public health departments.
- Technical barriers for operationalizing data privacy and security laws and regulations (e.g., consent management platforms).
- Legal and regulatory barriers - “real” or perceived - created by varying interpretations of state and federal data sharing privacy laws and regulations, which may be partially addressed by forthcoming state guidance.
- Need for a common identity strategy across public and private organizations seeking to exchange and use health and human service data.

² Name spelling approximated based on verbal statements.

Stakeholder Advisory Group Members also noted the significant work presently underway at the state (e.g., CalAIM) to address several of the noted barriers.

Data Exchange Framework Workplan

John Ohanian described the Data Exchange Framework development timeline and reviewed the proposed sequencing of topics for the remaining Stakeholder Advisory Group meetings.

Stakeholder Advisory Group Members shared feedback, including, but not limited to:

- Governance should be covered in an earlier than May 2022, given its complexity.
- Suggesting that separate subcommittees or workgroups are established to accelerate recommendation development in targeted areas as needs arise.

Data Sharing Agreement Subcommittee Update

Jennifer Schwartz, Chief Counsel, CalHHS, CDII, reviewed the purpose and role of the Data Sharing Agreement Subcommittee and provided a recap of the key takeaways from the first Data Sharing Agreement Subcommittee meeting (materials from that meeting can be found at: <https://www.chhs.ca.gov/data-exchange-framework/#november-8-2021>), which included:

- General consensus that while no existing data sharing agreement or framework met all of the requirements specified in AB 133, many core components of existing or emerging agreements could be leveraged and serve as a valuable foundation for the California Data Sharing Agreement.
- Recognition of the challenge of creating a single data sharing agreement that includes the necessary elements but is not so complex that it is difficult to execute and implement, particularly for new organizations implicated in data exchange requirements.
- Support for the idea that the California Data Sharing Agreement should refer to and leverage existing specifications and standards wherever possible rather than include detailed technical standards.

Closing Remarks

John Ohanian thanked Stakeholder Advisory Group Members and the public for their engagement. John Ohanian reviewed project next steps and noted that the next Stakeholder Advisory Group meeting is scheduled for December 14th.

Appendix 1. Data Exchange Framework Stakeholder Advisory Group Member - Meeting Attendance (November 10, 2021)

Last Name	First Name	Title	Organization	Designee	Present
Ghaly	Mark	Secretary (Chair)	California Health and Human Services Agency	N/A	No
Almanza	Jamie	CEO	Bay Area Community Services	N/A	Yes
Amarnath	Ashrith	Medical Director	California Health Benefit Exchange	N/A	Yes
Bacchi	Charles	President and CEO	California Association of Health Plans	N/A	Yes
Bargmann	Nancy	Director	Department of Developmental Services	N/A	Yes
Beckley	Mark	Chief Deputy Director	Department of Aging	N/A	No
Bindman	Andrew	Executive Vice President; Chief Medical Officer	Kaiser Foundation Health Plan, Inc. and Hospitals	Adams	Yes
Cabrera	Michelle Doty	Executive Director	County Behavioral Health Directors Association of California	N/A	Yes
Christman	Scott	Chief Deputy Director	Department of Health Care Access and Information	N/A	Yes
Cowling	David	Chief, Center for Information	California Public Employees' Retirement System	N/A	Yes
Coyle	Carmela	President and CEO	California Hospital Association	N/A	Yes
Dhawan	Rahul	Associate Medical Director	MedPoint Management (representing America's Physician Groups)	Crane	Yes
Diaz	Joe	Senior Policy Director and Regional Director	California Association of Health Facilities	Cornett	Yes
Fisher	Kayte	Attorney	Department of Insurance	N/A	Yes
Ford	David	Vice President, Health Information Technology	California Medical Association	Corcoran	Yes
Gibboney	Liz	CEO	Partnership HealthPlan of California	N/A	Yes

Last Name	First Name	Title	Organization	Designee	Present
Gibbons	Michelle	Executive Director	County Health Executives Association of California	Chawla	No
Hack	Lori	Interim Executive Director	California Association of Health Information Exchanges	N/A	Yes
Hernández	Sandra	President and CEO	California Health Care Foundation	N/A	No
Kaiser	Cameron	Deputy Public Health Officer	County of San Diego (representing the California Conference of Local Health Officers)	Relucio	Yes
Kiefer	Andrew	Vice President, State Government Affairs	Blue Shield of California	Markovich	Yes
Koopmans	Linnea	CEO	Local Health Plans of California	N/A	Yes
Legé	Matt	Government Relations Advocate	SEIU California	N/A	Yes
Lindeman	David	Director, CITRIS Health	UC Center for Information Technology Research in the Interest of Society	N/A	Yes
Lo	Julie	Executive Officer	Business, Consumer Services & Housing Agency	N/A	No
McAllister-Wallner	Amanda	Deputy Director	Health Access California	Wright	Yes
McCallin	DeeAnne	Director of Health Information Technology	California Primary Care Association	Beaudry	Yes
Modaressi	Ali	CEO	Los Angeles Network for Enhanced Services	N/A	Yes
Moore	Dana E.	Acting Deputy Director	Department of Public Health	N/A	Yes
Murray	Erica	President and CEO	California Association of Public Hospitals and Health Systems	N/A	Yes
Nau	Nathan	Deputy Director, Office of Plan Monitoring	Department of Managed Health Care	N/A	Yes
O'Malley	Janice	Legislative Advocate	California Labor Federation	Pulaski	Yes

Last Name	First Name	Title	Organization	Designee	Present
Savage	Mark	Managing Director, Digital Health Strategy and Policy	Savage & Savage LLC	N/A	Yes
Savage- Sangwan	Kiran	Executive Director	California Pan-Ethnic Health Network	N/A	Yes
Scott	Linette	Chief Data Officer	Department of Health Care Services	N/A	Yes
Senderling- McDonald	Cathy	Executive Director	County Welfare Directors Association	N/A	Yes
Toche	Diana	Undersecretary, Health Services	Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation	N/A	No
Vignalats	Julianna	Assistant Deputy Director	Department of Social Services	N/A	No
Williams	Claudia	CEO	Manifest MedEx	N/A	Yes
Witten-Rood	Leslie	Chief, Office of Health Information Exchange	Emergency Medical Services Authority	N/A	Yes
York	William	President and CEO	211 San Diego/Community Information Exchange	N/A	Yes